

Distr.
GENERAL
E/ESCWA/SDD/2013/Technical Paper.11
24 December 2014
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COMMISSION FOR WESTERN ASIA (ESCWA)

**MIGRATION AND THE POST-2015 DEVELOPMENT AGENDA
POLICY BRIEF 19**



United Nations
New York, 2013

1. Introduction

International migration is a major phenomenon in the Arab region: in 2013, over 30 million of the world's 232 million migrants were resident in Arab countries, while more than 22 million Arab nationals were living outside their countries of birth.¹ This mass movement of people has major development impacts.

On a global scale, migration has the potential to massively increase global economic welfare. Clemens estimates that “the emigration of less than 5 percent of the population of poor regions would bring global gains exceeding the gains from total elimination of all policy barriers to merchandise trade and all barriers to capital flows”.² As Knoll and Keijzer point out, “[f]or citizens of poor countries, this could mean benefits of USD 305 billion a year – about twice as much as combining estimated annual gains from full trade liberalization, foreign aid and debt relief.”³

Much of this increase stems from the fact that migrants have the potential to greatly increase their earning power by moving to other countries: over 80 per cent of migrants from 24 developing countries who moved between 2000 and 2002 moved to countries with a higher Human Development Index than their country of origin.⁴ The effects of this move can be substantial: for example, the average wage of a 35-year-old Yemeni male with nine years of education, working as an urban labourer in the United States, is 16.64 times higher than his equivalent working in Yemen; even at the lower end of the scale, a Moroccan worker with a similar profile could earn 2.37 times more in the United States than his equivalent in Morocco.⁵

This increase in wages has wider effects. It is often passed back to migrants' families through remittances. The World Bank estimates that over US\$49.5 billion in remittances were received by Arab countries in 2013, with countries such as Egypt and Lebanon featuring as some of the most important recipients of remittances in the world.⁶ These remittances have important effects, not only on macroeconomic stability in Arab countries but also on poverty reduction and social spending by recipient families. A survey in Egypt has found that the incidence of poverty in families who receive remittances is significantly lower than in those that did not; moreover, recipient families reported fewer problems paying for health, education, food, and even had extra money to cover emergencies.⁷ In many cases, remittances have been successfully channelled into job-creating businesses and community infrastructure, widening the circles of migration beneficiaries.⁸ Moreover, through migrants' acquisition and transfer of human and social capital in countries of destination, migrants can play a major role in building capacities in their countries of origin and linking them to global networks essential to their development.

¹ Author calculations based on United Nations Population Division, 2013, Trends in International Migration Stock: the 2013 Revision.

² Clemens, M. (2011). ‘Economics and emigration: trillion-dollar bills on the sidewalk?’ Center for Global Development. P. 2. Available from: http://www.cgdev.org/files/1425376_file_Clemens_Economics_and_Emigration_FINAL.pdf.

³ Knoll, A. and Keijzer, N. (2013) ‘Will a post-2015 development framework acknowledge migration?’ p. 55.

⁴ United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (2009). Human Development Report, pp. 22-3.

⁵ Clemens, M. and others (2009). The Place Premium: Wage Differences for Identical Workers Across the US Border, p. 11 Available from: <http://dash.harvard.edu/bitstream/handle/1/4412631/Clemens%20Place%20Premium.pdf?sequence=1>.

⁶ Author calculation from World Bank staff calculation based on data from IMF Balance of Payments Statistics database and data releases from central banks, national statistical agencies, and World Bank country desks, October release. See also World Bank (2013). Migration and Development Brief no. 21.

⁷ Nassar, H. (2009). ‘Migration and financial flows: Egypt in the MENA region’. CARIM Research Report 2009, no. 20, p. 24.

⁸ ESCWA (2010). A Conceptual Framework for Integrating Migration into Development Planning in the ESCWA Region, p. 7.

It must be acknowledged, however, that migration can also play a negative role: where large numbers of highly-skilled migrants leave a country, the loss of investment in training and education, potential tax revenue, and human capital and skills (particularly where these are in key social sectors such as health or education) can hinder the country's ability to meet its development goals.⁹

Despite the importance of international migration for development, it has so far been the subject of only limited consideration in the development agendas developed under the auspices of the United Nations, with the exception of the 1994 Cairo Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development. Little attention has been paid, therefore, to how migrants are affected by development processes; what contribution they could make to these processes; or the potential obstacles that migration could create.

In preparation for the 2015 deadline of the Millennium Development Goals, the United Nations system and its Member States are reflecting on and discussing the shape of a new development agenda to carry forward the progress towards development spurred by the Millennium Development Goals. Particular effort is being dedicated to taking stock of new approaches and ideas about development as well as accounting for the new trends and forces shaping the world today. This framework makes a discussion of how migration might fit into the new development agenda highly relevant. Moreover, Arab countries (among others) have already begun to call for the inclusion of migration in the post-2015 development agenda; it is therefore important to consider how this aim can be realised.

This policy brief summarizes the record on references to migration in development agendas pursued by the United Nations, before going on to examine how the various processes and actors involved in the discussions and negotiations over the future development agenda beyond 2015 have conceptualized migration. The report then presents suggestions for how to integrate migration into development agendas; indicates to what extent these ideas are relevant to Arab countries; and suggests how Arab countries can ensure that the post-2015 development framework captures the reality of migration's impact on their development.

2. Migration in existing development agendas

Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development

The first development framework to give major consideration to the impacts of migration on development in was the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD), passed in Cairo in 1994. One of the chapters of the Programme of Action focused on "International Migration", noting that "international migration ... both affects and is affected by the development process" in positive and negative ways. While noting that the ultimate aim of economic policy should be "making the option to remain in one's country a viable one for all people", the Programme of Action also called for "more cooperation and dialogue between countries of origin and countries of destination in order to maximize the benefits of migration to those concerned and increase the likelihood that migration has positive consequences for the development of both sending and receiving countries". It suggested that areas of cooperation should include issues such as temporary migration, the integration of international migration into national development strategies, technical cooperation and data-gathering. The Programme of Action also indicated specific measures that should be taken by countries of origin and destination to ensure "the social and economic integration of documented migrants", to address irregular migration while respecting the rights of irregular migrants, and to protect and support refugees.¹⁰

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ United Nations Population Fund (1994). Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development. Available from: <http://www.unfpa.org/public/cache/offonce/home/sitemap/icpd/International-Conference-on-Population-and-Development/ICPD-Programme.jsessionid=34141D52524D7C63F17557A43D225D20.jahia01>.

The Programme of Action addressed international migration in a comprehensive manner, within the context of a rights-based approach to human development. It recognized migrants as both agents supporting development processes as well as subjects of these processes, and asserted that incorporating migration and the needs of migrants into development processes would be beneficial to all. The Programme of Action also noted that the aim should not be to substitute migration for development, but rather to ensure that migration was a choice entered into voluntarily and with the opportunity to expand human capacities, thus making it an expression of development. The chapter of the Programme of Action that deals with migration has, however, been “more or less ignored in practice.”¹¹

The Millennium Development Goals

The Millennium Declaration, which forms the basis of the MDGs, did mention migrants under the heading of “Human rights, democracy and good governance”, committing to “take measures to ensure respect for and protection of the human rights of migrants, migrant workers and their families, to eliminate the increasing acts of racism and xenophobia in many societies and to promote greater harmony and tolerance in all societies.”¹²

However, the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), which represent perhaps the most widely-supported development agenda in the history of the United Nations, do not focus on the broader objectives of the Millennium Declaration. To some extent, this reflects both the functional and political context of the development of the MDGs:

- Functionally, “[t]he MDGs are ends rather than means”, focusing more on the quantifiable outcomes of development (such as eradicating extreme poverty, or the achievement of universal primary education) rather than the tools countries use to reach these goals. The exception to this rule, Millennium Development Goal 8, which focuses on developing a “Global Partnership for Development”, focuses more on macroeconomic inputs to development with a clear and direct link to the previous MDGs.
- Politically, meanwhile, the process of formulation of the MDGs appears to have been “predominantly influenced ... by the priorities and objectives of large donor countries rather than the needs and priorities of developing countries”,¹³ thus reflecting both their economic approaches (focusing on growth rather than inequalities, not addressing structural issues) and their political objectives.¹⁴

Thus, the broader agenda of the Millennium Declaration was simplified in translation as the MDGs, which focus on a set of “overriding human development goals”. The functional, “means rather than ends” framework of the MDGs precluded the inclusion of migration per se as a goal, target or indicator, as well as any discussion of the means by which migration could contribute to the achievement of the MDGs.¹⁵ Meanwhile, the political climate of the early 2000s, and the political objectives of the large donors (most of whom remain important countries of destination for migrants), were not favourable to discussions of

¹¹ Newland, K. (2005). ‘The Governance of international migration: mechanisms, processes and institutions’. Global Commission on International Migration, p. 1.

¹² United Nations General Assembly (2000). Millennium Declaration, p. 7. Available from: <http://www.un.org/millennium/declaration/ares552e.pdf>.

¹³ United Nations Regional Commissions (2013). A Regional Perspective on the United Nations Post-2015 Development Agenda, p. 13. Available from: <http://www.regionalcommissions.org/post2015regionalreport.pdf>.

¹⁴ See, for example, Chamie, J. and Mirkin, B. (2011). ‘Who’s afraid of international migration in the United Nations?’ in Koslowski, R. (ed). Global Mobility Regimes. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

¹⁵ United Nations Regional Commissions (2013), p. 17.

migration at that time. Finally, migration was then only beginning to gain recognition as an important factor in policymaking for development.

For these reasons, the MDGs did not consider migration or migrants in their goals, targets or indicators.¹⁶ Similarly, guidance developed by United Nations agencies for the implementation of the MDGs treated migration as a marginal phenomenon and migrants as no more than subjects of development.¹⁷ In the intervening years, however, migration has been recognized as of great importance, not only for development in general but for the achievement of the MDGs in particular. For example, empirical evidence indicated that a 10 per cent increase in remittances would lead to a 1.6 per cent reduction in poverty.¹⁸ However, because migration was largely absent from the MDGs, despite mounting evidence of its significance, the complex interlinkages between migration and MDG achievement were difficult to bring to the attention of policymakers. Thus, it has been difficult either to maximize the positive impacts of migration on development, or to minimize negative impacts on countries of origin, countries of destination and migrants themselves.

3. Considerations of migration in the post-2015 development agenda

Since the formulation of the ICPD Programme of Action and the Millennium Development Goals, awareness of migration's impact on development has increased, spurred in part by the discovery of the scale of migrants' remittances to their countries of origin, as well as greater leadership by the United Nations on this issue.¹⁹ As a result of this knowledge and leadership, greater international attention has been paid to this topic, resulting in a number of key initiatives, notably the High-level Dialogues on International Migration and Development held at the United Nations General Assembly in 2006 and 2013,²⁰ and the Global Forum on Migration and Development, an annual, informal State-led and State-owned discussion on the migration-development nexus. These initiatives have resulted in the articulation of a consensus among States, international organizations and civil society organizations recognizing "the important contribution made by migrants and migration to development in countries of origin, transit and destination, as well as the complex interrelationship between migration and development".²¹

The extent of this shift can be seen by the increased inclusion of migration in consideration of the post-2015 United Nations development agenda. Below are a series of initiatives undertaken to consider, in part or in whole, the shape of this agenda, with an analysis of how they consider migrants and migration within their respective frameworks.

United Nations Task Team on the Post-2015 Development Agenda

Over 50 United Nations entities and international organizations participate in the United Nations Task Team on the Post-2015 United Nations Development Agenda (UNTT), providing "system-wide support to

¹⁶ Martin, P. (2013). Labour Migration and Development Indicators in the Post-2015 Global Development Framework, p. 67. Available from: <http://www.iom.int/files/live/sites/iom/files/What-We-Do/docs/Labour-Migration-and-Development-Indicators-in-the-Post-2015-Global-Development-Framework.pdf>. (link not working) See also Laczko and Brian (2013), p. 7.

¹⁷ Usher, E. (2005). The Millennium Development Goals and Migration, pp. 12-13. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.

¹⁸ Ibid., p. 16.

¹⁹ See for example, Newland (2005), p. 2.

²⁰ United Nations General Assembly (2006). High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Available from: <http://www.un.org/esa/population/migration/hld/index.html>; and United Nations General Assembly (2013). Declaration of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Available from: <http://www.un.org/esa/population/meetings/HLD2013/mainhld2013.html>.

²¹ United Nations General Assembly (2013).

the post-2015 consultation process, including analytical input, expertise and outreach.”²² In its report to the Secretary-General, *Realizing the Future We Want For All*, the UNTT includes migration within its section on “Shifting Global Demographics”, noting that

[i]nternational migration is bringing benefits to both countries of origin and destination, including remittances and reduced labour shortages. The transfer of resources, skills, knowledge, ideas and networks through migration is difficult to quantify, yet significant. Many millions of migrants have also benefited from building a better future for themselves and their dependants. However, too many migrants continue to work and live in insecure, precarious and dangerous conditions, often marginalized and subject to discrimination and without access to social and health care services, while disruptions to family life can have significant social consequences, particularly in the country of origin.²³

It also discusses the fact that, although “rising migration” is a challenge “with global ramifications ... the policies, rules and institutions established to govern [migration] are mostly national, while global mechanisms are strongly compartmentalized.”²⁴

The report goes on to highlight “Fair rules to manage migration” among the factors it names as “enablers” of development,²⁵ considering that

The dynamism of migrants and their economic and other contributions to both their countries of origin and host countries need to be more fully harnessed, above all by recognizing migrants as positive agents of innovation with human rights. Better managing migration, both in countries of origin and destination, will be essential.²⁶

The UNTT argues that focusing on these enablers will lead to policy coherence, a critical factor in the achievement of the future development goals. Thus the UNTT proposes that a “reshaped and reinvigorated global partnership for development will also be essential to improve management of migration flows and to enhance their contribution to the creation of wealth, trade, jobs and social empowerment.”²⁷ This partnership should be “truly global and contain goals for all stakeholders.”²⁸ This partnership could be both a standalone goal, and mainstreamed across other thematic goals.

The UNTT also recognizes that migrants are subjects of development who may have differential access to the outcomes of development. As such, it argues that migrants deserve special consideration as a “vulnerable group”,²⁹ and suggests that data gathered in the context of the post-2015 development agenda be disaggregated by “migrant status”.³⁰

²² United Nations Task Team (2012). *Realizing the Future We Want For All*, p. 2. Available from: http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/policy/untaskteam_undf/untt_report.pdf.

²³ Ibid., p. 15.

²⁴ Ibid., p. 18.

²⁵ Ibid., p. 24.

²⁶ Ibid., p. 30.

²⁷ Ibid., p. 36.

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ United Nations Task Team (2012), p. 31.

³⁰ Ibid., p. 38.

The UNTT provides a compelling argument for considering migrants both as agents and subjects of development, and proposes a framework for the integration of migration into the post-2015 development agenda.

2012 United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (Rio+20)

The United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development held in Rio De Janeiro, Brazil in 2012 was a follow-up from the first 1992 Conference on Environment and Development. The Conference aimed to “to shape how we can reduce poverty, advance social equity and ensure environmental protection on an ever more crowded planet to get to the future we want.”³¹ It was based on the principle of sustainable development, defined as “development [that] meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” and which is based on three pillars: “economic development, social development and environmental protection.”³²

The outcome document of this meeting (adopted as General Assembly Resolution A/RES/66/288) includes migration among its areas of focus, in the following ways:

- Migrants are considered as a group whose “meaningful involvement and active participation” is required for sustainable development.³³
- Under “Health and population”, the countries “commit to systematically consider population trends and projections in [their] national, rural and urban development strategies and policies”, noting that “through forward-looking planning, [they] can seize the opportunities and address the challenges associated with demographic change, including migration.”³⁴
- Finally, the section on “Promoting full and productive employment, decent work for all and social protection”, calls on States to:

... promote and protect effectively the human rights and fundamental freedoms of all migrants regardless of migration status, especially those of women and children, and to address international migration through international, regional or bilateral cooperation and dialogue and a comprehensive and balanced approach, recognizing the roles and responsibilities of countries of origin, transit and destination in promoting and protecting the human rights of all migrants, and avoiding approaches that might aggravate their vulnerability.³⁵

Thus migrants are considered to be agents of sustainable development, who should be consulted and participate in decision-making processes, as well as subjects of development, whose rights should be protected and whose actions should be taken into consideration by development planning.

This outcome document also calls for the development of a set of “Sustainable Development Goals” to feed into the post-2015 development agenda. These goals should be in line with existing agreements, principles and the outcome document of the conference, “action-oriented, concise, easy to communicate, limited in number, aspirational, global in nature, universally applicable to all countries while taking into account different national realities, capacities and levels of development and respecting national policies and

³¹ United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (2012). The Rio +20 Conference. Available from: <http://www.uncsd2012.org/about.html>.

³² United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (2012).

³³ United Nations General Assembly (2012). The Future We Want, p. 8.

³⁴ Ibid., p. 28.

³⁵ Ibid., p. 30.

priorities.”³⁶ To shape this new set of goals, an open-ended working group of States has been set up. In its latest session, this working group noted that “migration can bring development benefits, as well as challenges”, suggesting that migration is being considered in the framework of these new SDGs.³⁷

Dhaka Declaration

Co-organized by the Governments of Switzerland and Bangladesh under the umbrella of the global thematic consultations which have been held on topics considered relevant to the post-2015 agenda, the Global Thematic Consultation on Population Dynamics in the Post-2015 Development Agenda led to a high-level Global Leadership Meeting in Dhaka, Bangladesh in March 2013. This meeting aimed “to provide a clear and common vision on how population dynamics should be integrated in the post-2015 development agenda ... largely focus[ing] on developing concrete recommendations including the identification of possible goals, targets and indicators, on ‘how to’ address and harness population dynamics in the post-2015 development agenda”.³⁸ One of the priority areas that this meeting focused on was how countries could “address particular population dynamics” —notably international migration— “to address associated challenges and harness associated developmental opportunities.”³⁹

As a result of the high priority given to international migration in the conceptual framework of the meeting, the final outcome of this intergovernmental meeting (the Dhaka Declaration of the Global Leadership Meeting on Population Dynamics in the context of the Post-2015 Development Agenda, or “Dhaka Declaration”) gives international migration a prominent place in its conclusions. Migration is considered one of the “population mega-trends ... [which] constitute important developmental challenges and opportunities in the 21st century ... [and are] at the forefront of international and national development agendas”, affecting as they do all three pillars of sustainable development.⁴⁰

Thus the overarching recommendations of the Declaration include both the need to “strengthen migrants governance to achieve a balanced and equitable system that is socially and culturally acceptable to people and beneficial for all” as well as a call to “take into account the ... different needs of ... international migrants”. Migration is also considered in the recommendation to “generate and gain access to productive and remunerative employment and decent work, both at home and abroad”.⁴¹ Meanwhile, the Declaration’s specific recommendations on migration note that countries should “[e]nsure that migrants are considered as agents of development”, and that countries should put in place coherent frameworks and “establish global partnerships in the post-2015 framework to ensure that migration contributes to equitable and sustainable development”. Specific measures to implement this agenda include:

- Ensuring that “migration is safe and orderly and that adequate protection and assistance are extended to all migrants, in particular to migrants caught in crises”;
- Promoting and rationalizing labour mobility through tools such as skill matching, “enhancing portability of social security entitlements, recognition of educational and professional

³⁶ United Nations Sustainable Development Knowledge Platform (2012). Questionnaire related to the development of Sustainable Development Goals. Available from: <http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?menu=1485>.

³⁷ United Nations Sustainable Development (2013). Co-Chairs’ summary bullet points from OWG-4. Available from: <http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/1871cochairsummary.pdf>.

³⁸ International Organization for Migration (2013). Concept Note and Agenda, Global Leadership Meeting, Population Dynamics and the Post-2015 UN Development Agenda. Available from: <http://www.worldwewant2015.org/fr/node/303691>.

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ International Organization for Migration (2013). Dhaka Declaration of the Global Leadership Meeting on Population Dynamics in the context of the Post-2015 Development Agenda, p. 2. Available from: <https://www.iom.int/files/live/sites/iom/files/What-We-Do/docs/Dhaka-Declaration.pdf>.

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 2.

qualifications and adoption of enabling legal frameworks aimed at enlargement of freedom of opportunities of individuals”;

- Enabling migrants to engage in development activities through ensuring that they have “opportunities ... to seek employment abroad securely and at low cost, transfer savings and ... incentives to trade with and invest in origin and destination countries”;
- Ensuring that migration is considered as a tool in adaptation to the impacts of climate change.⁴²

Thus the Dhaka Declaration considers migration as a potential development enabler, and calls for migrants to be considered as both agents and subjects of development.

High-Level Panel (HLP) of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda

The High-level Panel was set up to “advise on the global development framework beyond 2015”.⁴³ The report to the Secretary General prepared by the HLP identified a set of challenges and opportunities to which the post-2015 development agenda should respond, as well as a set of illustrative goals which aim to build on and expand the MDG framework. However, although the conceptual framework for the assumptions made by the HLP included an estimate of 30 million additional migrants “remitting an additional \$60 billion to their home countries through low-cost channels,”⁴⁴ there is no particular consideration of migration in the illustrative goals and targets developed by the HLP.

Nonetheless, the HLP does suggest that “indicators be disaggregated to allow targets to be measured in various dimensions, by gender, geography, age, and ethnicity, for example.”⁴⁵ This could be extended to include a proxy for national/non-national status so that migrants are not left behind in the process of achieving the new goals. Overall, though, migration is notable by its absence from the Report of the HLP.

The Second High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development

The first High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development, held at the United Nations General Assembly in September 2006, was a milestone in highlighting the existence of a consensus among Member States that “migrants contributed to development in both developing and developed countries”.⁴⁶ As a result of the success of the first High-level Dialogue and intergovernmental discussions on migration and development, held in the framework of the Global Forum on Migration and Development between 2006 and 2012, a second High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development was held in October 2013. The overarching theme of this dialogue was “Identifying concrete measures to strengthen coherence and cooperation at all levels, with a view to enhancing the benefits of international migration for migrants and countries alike and its important links to development, while reducing its negative implications”.⁴⁷ In addition to a plenary session, the Dialogue included four roundtables, the first of which focused on

⁴² Ibid., p. 3.

⁴³ United Nations High-Level Panel (2012). The Post-2015 Development Agenda. Available from: <http://www.post2015hlp.org/about/>.

⁴⁴ United Nations High-level Panel (2013). A New Global Partnership: Eradicate Poverty And Transform Economies Through Sustainable Development. New York, p. 18. Available from: http://www.un.org/sg/management/pdf/HLP_P2015_Report.pdf.

⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 58.

⁴⁶ United Nations General Assembly (2006). Summary of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Note by the President of the General Assembly (October) A/61/515, p. 2.

⁴⁷ United Nations General Assembly (2013). Organization of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Note by the Secretary General (July) A/68/162, p. 1.

“Assessing the effects of international migration on sustainable development and identifying relevant priorities in view of the preparation of the post-2015 development framework.”⁴⁸

Many interventions by Member States during the High-level Dialogue focused on the need to ensure that migration is integrated into the post-2015 development agenda. The statement of the Government of Fiji, representing the Group of 77 plus China, noted that the theme of the High-level Dialogue “promotes policy coherence and institutional development, including the factoring of migration into national development policies and plans and into the post-2015 Development Agenda”.⁴⁹ Several Arab countries, including Libya and Yemen, associated themselves with this statement, while others discussed the topic of integrating migration into the post-2015 development agenda. For example:

- Egypt noted that “‘International Migration’ should also feature in ... discussions in the run-up to the elaboration of the post-2015 development agenda, as a cross-cutting enabler to the achievement of development in all its dimensions”;⁵⁰
- Morocco argued that the High-level Dialogue was an opportunity for Member States to “bring migration back into the UN system in an effective manner through its integration in the framework of development after 2015”;⁵¹
- The United Arab Emirates called for “a new phase of international cooperation that aims at highlighting labour mobility in the UN post- 2015 development agenda, maximizing its impact and benefits and minimizing its negative effects on development, and seeking to enable the Member States to develop their national policies and strengthen their bilateral and multilateral cooperation for this purpose”;⁵²
- The Sudan expressed its appreciation for the concept of integrating international migration into the post-2015 development agenda, and noted its readiness to work with all parties towards the agenda’s formulation;⁵³

Clear support therefore existed among Member States, including Arab countries, for the integration of international migration into the post-2015 development agenda. Echoing this position, civil society representatives participating in the High-level Dialogue also called for

[the] integration of migration into the post-2015 development agenda to address not only the contributions that migrants make to development in countries of origin and destination, but also the possibilities for better policy planning and coherence that can make migration more genuinely a choice and not a necessity, and greater

⁴⁸ Ibid., p. 3.

⁴⁹ Sixty-eighth session of the General Assembly (2013). The High-level dialogue on international migration and development: Statement on behalf of the Group of 77 and China by H.E. Mr. Joketani Cokanasiga, Minister of Defense, National Security and Immigration, Republic of Fiji, New York, 3-4 October.

⁵⁰ Address by H.E Ambassador Mootaz Ahmadein Khalil, Permanent Representative of the Arab Republic of Egypt to the United Nations, to the 2013 High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development, New York, 4 October 2013.

⁵¹ Address by Minister of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation, Morocco, to the 2013 High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development, New York, 3-4 October 2013.

⁵² Intervention by H.E. Dr Saeed Al-Shamsi, Assistant Foreign Minister of the United Arab Emirates for International Organizations At the Plenary Meeting of the "High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development", New York, 4 October 2013.

⁵³ Sudan Delegation at the General Assembly. The High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development. Available from: <https://papersmart.unmeetings.org/media2/157937/21e-sudan.pdf>.

gain than drain. This development agenda would work to affirm both the right to migrate and the right to remain at home with decent work and human security.⁵⁴

This consensus on the importance of integrating migration into the post-2015 development agenda was reflected in the final “Declaration of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development”, which acknowledged “the important contribution of migration in realizing the Millennium Development Goals, and recognize[d] that human mobility is a key factor for sustainable development which should be adequately considered in the elaboration of the post-2015 development agenda”. It further called on “all relevant bodies, agencies, funds and programmes of the United Nations system, other relevant intergovernmental, regional and subregional organizations ... and the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on International Migration and Development, within their respective mandates, to ... consider migration issues in their contributions to the preparatory process that will establish the post-2015 development agenda”.⁵⁵

Suggestions and their relevance to Arab countries

Thus most processes, including intergovernmental processes, engaged in elaborating the United Nations development agenda beyond 2015 have reached a consensus that migration should be integrated into this agenda. It is therefore important to consider the most appropriate ways in which this goal can be achieved. This section will set out some of the main options that have been considered, and indicate their relevance to the countries of the Arab region.

In reflecting on how migration may best be included in the post-2015 development agenda, the following options have been suggested:

- a. Including migration as part of a 2015 declaration/statement

Any high-level statement outlining the principles of the post-2015 development agenda could build on elements not highlighted in the MDG agenda, such as by mentioning migration as an enabler of sustainable development. This is a relatively feasible option, and would have the advantage of “significantly contribut[ing] to raising awareness and shaping views on the role that migration can play in a post-2015 context”.⁵⁶ Kenny provides an example of what such a statement could look like:

We recognize the importance of cross-border movement of people to broad-based development and we commit to facilitating that movement both with regard to temporary and permanent relocation, including the strengthening of global institutions that support such facilitation. We commit to work towards agreeing stronger international standards governing professional and technical qualification to improve the portability of skills worldwide.⁵⁷

This formulation could be useful for Arab countries, as it provides them with a strong normative backing to negotiate for improved mobility to countries of destination. Meanwhile, the focus on improvement of skills certification would fit very closely with the agenda of Arab countries of destination

⁵⁴ United Nations High-level Dialogue Civil Society (UN HLD Civil Society) (2013). The 5-Year Action Plan for Collaboration Focusing on the Rights of Migrants, p.1. Available from: <http://hldcivilsociety.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/0261-HDL-The-5-year-Action-Plan-GB-web2.pdf>.

⁵⁵ United Nations General Assembly, 2013, Declaration of the High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development A/68/L.5.

⁵⁶ Lucci, P. and Martins, P. 2013. ‘Labour migration in the post-2015 development agenda’, p. 43.

⁵⁷ Kenny, C. (2013). ‘A UN Declaration on the Post-2015 Development Agenda’. Center for Global Development Essay (August), p. 8.

such as Qatar to upgrade the skills of their migrant workforces.⁵⁸ However, it may also risk being sidelined as the process moves towards the development of tangible goals, as much of the Millennium Declaration was.⁵⁹

b. Creating a standalone migration goal

Building on this statement, it would be possible to include a standalone goal related to international migration. Knoll and Keijzer suggest that this approach “would certainly give prominence to the contribution of migration to poverty reduction and development”, and suggest that a potential formulation could be “enhancing the benefits of international migration for migrants and countries alike and its important links to development, while reducing its negative implications”, with targets related to “reducing the costs of migration, admitting a quota of international migrants or ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families and the International Labour Organization conventions concerning migrant workers (Conventions Nos. 97 and 143)”.⁶⁰

Certainly, such an approach would create measurable goals and indicators related to migration and development, hitherto lacking on the international stage. Insofar as it focused on migration costs and the rights of migrants it would be of relevance to migrants from Arab countries, many of whom are exposed to the risk of violations of their rights; if these rights were protected, their potential to contribute to development could be increased. This approach might also provide some political impetus to increase the number of ratifications of conventions dealing with the rights of migrants, currently among the least-ratified in the world.⁶¹

There are also risks associated with this approach, especially insofar as standalone goals could “overload” the post-2015 agenda, compromising its “clarity and focus”—features considered among the key strengths of the MDGs,⁶² which the post-2015 agenda is intended to carry forward.⁶³ Additionally, the approach may lack sufficient political support;⁶⁴ and there is a risk that migration, the effects of which are wide-ranging and multi-sectoral, could be artificially isolated in a single area, rather than being addressed in a consistent and holistic manner across the many fields where its impact may be felt.

c. Mainstreaming migration as an enabler

An alternative to having a specific goal to cover migration would be to consider it as an enabler of various development goals that should be mainstreamed across different levels. As Knoll and Keijzer explain, “this means that, when focusing on achieving a certain goal, the potential contribution of international migration, as well as the possible constraint posed by mobility, would be taken into account when designing policy strategies.”⁶⁵ This would allow for migration to be taken into account across a broad

⁵⁸ Qatar General Secretariat for Development Planning (2008). Qatar National Vision 2030. Available from: http://www.qdb.qa/English/Documents/QNV2030_English.pdf.

⁵⁹ Richter, C. (2013). ‘Migration as a development enabler: Putting enablers into practice in the post-2015 development agenda’, p. 112.

⁶⁰ Knoll and Keijzer (2013), pp. 57-58.

⁶¹ The International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families has only been ratified by 47 States, few of which are major countries of destination for migrants (http://treaties.un.org/pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg_no=IV-13&chapter=4&lang=en).

⁶² Knoll and Keijzer (2013), pp. 57-58.

⁶³ See, for example, UNGA (2012), A/RES/66/288, which notes that the “sustainable development goals should be limited in number” (p. 47).

⁶⁴ Richter (2013), p. 113.

⁶⁵ Knoll and Keijzer (2013), p. 58.

range of areas of development, such as poverty reduction through remittances; the impact of the emigration of skilled health professionals on health-care systems;⁶⁶ or the role that migration plays in such countries as Egypt, Lebanon and Yemen on women's empowerment or children's ability to access education.⁶⁷

Certainly, this approach would allow for a more holistic understanding of the impact of migration, and a more nuanced understanding of how migration could positively or negatively affect the achievement of different development goals at different levels. This approach may also prove to be more politically feasible.⁶⁸ The risk, however, is a reduced focus on migration, especially in the absence of specific targets or indicators.⁶⁹

d. Monitoring the impact of migration on the achievement of post-2015 goals, and the effects of these goals on migrants

A complementary strategy to Option B, 'creating a standalone migration goal', would be to ensure that migration is integrated into the monitoring framework, either by setting specific objectives for migrants,⁷⁰ or by disaggregating the data to document the differing experiences of specific groups, including migrants, with regard to progress towards the overall goals of the post-2015 development agenda. Both approaches would enable Governments to adjust their strategies to maximize their positive impact on these groups. This would be of particular relevance in the countries of the Gulf Cooperation Council, for example, which have large numbers of immigrants, facing different human development challenges than the national population. As mentioned above, this approach is supported by the United Nations Task Team and High-Level Panel reports. While it would certainly be helpful in understanding the impact of development on migrants, this approach carries the risk of neglecting the impact of migration and migrants on development.

e. A new target focused on developing a global partnership on migration.

A final suggestion would be to include a goal on migration governance as part of a global partnership on the model of MDG 8, but "reoriented given the changed context, new actors and new challenges and ... directly linked to the dimensions of the post-2015 agenda".⁷¹ This "reshaped and reinvigorated global partnership for development will also be essential to improve management of migration flows and to enhance their contribution to the creation of wealth, trade, jobs and social empowerment".⁷² This partnership could be multifaceted, focusing on issues such as:

- Reducing costs and improving the means of transfer and use of remittances;
- Determining the principles which should underlie dialogue and cooperation on labour mobility, such as ensuring that it is "safe, lawful, [and] less costly"⁷³ and measuring the number and impact of policies emanating from these dialogues and forums for cooperation;

⁶⁶ Dumont, J.C. (2010). 'Update and extension of the Database on Immigrants in OECD Countries (DIOC)'. Presentation at the Workshop on International Migration and Development in the Arab Region: Integrating International Migration into Development Strategies, Beirut, 19-22 July.

⁶⁷ See Assaad, R. (2010). 'The Impact of migration on those left behind: Evidence from Egypt'. Available from: <http://www.mei.edu/content/impact-migration-those-left-behind-evidence-egypt#edn5>.

⁶⁸ Richter (2013), p. 113.

⁶⁹ Knoll and Keijzer (2013), pp. 58-59.

⁷⁰ Ibid.

⁷¹ UNTT (2012), p. 35.

⁷² Ibid, p. 36.

⁷³ Laczko F. and Brian T. (2013). Introduction. In *Migration and the United Nations Post-2015 Development Agenda*, p. 14.

- Ensuring that international recruitment of health workers is not exploitative for developing countries;
- Partnering to address the issues raised by mobility linked to environmental factors, so that mobility is facilitated in a way that increases resilience to shocks such as natural disasters in communities of origin and destination.⁷⁴

This approach would fit well with the focus of the many of the post-2015 processes underway on global partnerships and the need to address global issues.⁷⁵ It may also be more politically feasible to set out broad principles (such as the need to promote improved migration governance to ensure the safety and rights of migrants) and concrete activities on issues such as the need to reduce the cost of remittances, on which there is broad consensus. It could also be a means of rebalancing the global partnership towards a more equal footing. This goal on partnership would, however, require indicators if it is to avoid the fate of MDG 8, which has remained relatively unimplemented in practice.⁷⁶

Conclusions and Recommendations

This report has sought to demonstrate the high importance for Arab countries of integrating migration into the post-2015 development agenda. Indeed, a broad consensus on this issue is already taking shape, and has been expressed through most of the processes currently deliberating the content of the post-2015 development agenda. There are several concrete proposals for how migration can practically be mainstreamed into any new framework; all of them have the potential to benefit Arab countries.

In practice, although all of the suggestions for integrating migration into the post-2015 agenda have potential benefits and drawbacks, a consensus is being formed among experts in favour of a mixed approach, comprising the following elements:

- A reference to migration as an enabler of development in any foundational statement for the post-2015 development agenda;
- A specific target under the goal of ‘a new global partnership for development’, which sees migrants as agents and subjects of development, and thus seeks to facilitate voluntary mobility and engage migrants as partners for development, while respecting their human rights;
- Under other goals, indicators targeted at migrants, combined with a systematic disaggregation of data showing how migrants fare compared to non-migrants, would ensure that migrants are included in the achievement of the post-2015 development agenda.

This approach ensures that the effects of development on migration and migrants are understood; that the potentials for migration to contribute to development are taken into account; and that the resulting framework remains simple and clear. Box 1 provides an example of a “maximalist vision” of how this would work, based on the illustrative set of goals proposed by the High-level Panel Report.

Moving forward, given the relevance of migration to development in Arab countries, the States of the region could use their membership in fora related to the elaboration of the post-2015 development agenda (such as the open working group on sustainable development goals) to lobby for the inclusion of a target on migration governance along the lines laid out in box 1; to ensure that data are systematically disaggregated so that the effects of development on migrants are clear; and that throughout the new agenda and the goals it sets out, the potential contributions of migrants, and the potential impacts of these goals on migrants, are taken into account.

⁷⁴ Rosengärtner, S. and Lönnback, L.J. (2013). ‘Developing a global partnership on migration and development in the post-2015 agenda’. Chapter 6 in International Organization for Migration (ed.), *Migration and the United Nations Post-2015 Development Agenda*, pp. 124-129.

⁷⁵ Richter (2013), p. 113; and Rosengärtner and Lönnback (2013), p. 120.

⁷⁶ Regional Commissions (2013), p. 20.

Box. Suggested migration-related development targets and indicators

Goal 1: End poverty

Target 1a: Bring the number of people living on less than US\$1.25 a day to zero and reduce by x% the number of people living below their country's 2015 national poverty line

Possible migration-related indicators:

- Cost of remittance transfers to LDCs
- Number of LDCs that link remittances to local community development and access to financial services
- Number of LDCs participating in regional and bilateral labour mobility and trade in services agreements

Target 1d: Build resilience and reduce deaths from natural disasters by x%

Possible migration-related indicators:

- Inclusion of migration in local planning for low-elevation coastal zones and other climate-vulnerable zones
- Inclusion of migration in disaster risk reduction strategies

Goal 4: Ensure healthy lives

Target 4e: Reduce the burden of diseases such as HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, neglected tropical diseases and priority non-communicable diseases

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Number of countries that grant migrants, regardless of their status, equal access to preventative and curative health services

Goal 8: Create jobs, sustainable livelihoods, and equitable growth

Target 8b: Decrease the number of young people not in education, employment or training by x%

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Percentage of young people who receive skills development training and have access to foreign employment

Target 8c: Strengthen productive capacity by providing universal access to financial services and infrastructure such as transportation and ICT

Possible migration-related indicators:

- Percentage of migrant remittances transferred using new technologies
- Percentage of migrant remittance senders and receivers with access to other financial services
- Rates of financial literacy of senders and receivers of remittances

Target 8d: Increase new start-ups by x and value added from new products by y through creating an enabling business environment and boosting entrepreneurship

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Number of businesses created through migrant remittances or diaspora investment

Goal 10: Ensure good governance and effective institutions

PROPOSED NEW TARGET – 10f: Prevent and eliminate all forms of human trafficking, especially trafficking in women and children

Possible migration-related indicators:

- Number of prosecutions relating to human trafficking
- Number of countries having special visa protections for victims of trafficking
- Number of businesses screening their supply chains for forced labour, especially child labour

Goal 11: Ensure stable and peaceful societies

Target 11c: Stem the external stressors that lead to conflict, including those related to organized crime

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Existence of frameworks at all levels for managing large-scale population displacements

Target 11d: Enhance the capacity, professionalism and accountability of the security forces, police and judiciary

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Number of countries that have adopted codes of conduct and provide human rights training for border enforcement agencies and personnel.

Box. (continued)

Goal 12: Create a global enabling environment and catalyse long-term finance

Target 12b: Implement reforms to ensure stability of the global financial system and encourage stable, long-term private foreign investment

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Number of countries that have issued diaspora bonds and volume of funds invested

Target 12f: Promote collaboration on and access to science, technology, innovation, and development data

Possible migration-related indicator:

- Number of countries with established expatriate/diaspora networks to facilitate the circulation of knowledge, ideas and technology

PROPOSED NEW TARGET – 12g: Create cooperative agreements related to human mobility to enable safe, lawful, less costly migration across or within borders

Possible migration-related indicators:

- Number of arrangements for freedom of movement under regional integration frameworks and number of people moving under those agreements;
- Existence of provisions for the protection of migrants' rights under mobility agreements;
- Number of national laws and international agreements on the recognition of foreign qualifications and number of foreign qualifications recognized;
- Number of agreements concerning the portability of benefits and number of people covered, or volume of funds transferred, under those agreements;
- Costs for documentation, visas and recruitment borne by migrants.

Source: Rosengärtner and Lönnback, (2013), "Developing a global partnership on migration and development in the post-2015 agenda", pps. 132-135.