ESCWA regional workshop on road safety management in the Arab countries, Beirut, 27-28 November 2018

Improving road crash data collection systems and data sharing in the EuroMed region

Michalis Adamantiadis
Team Leader, Road Transport Key Expert, EuroMed TSP
The Project

• EU funded in the context of European Neighbourhood Instrument (ENI) – South

• Assist the creation of an integrated transport system in the Mediterranean

• **Duration:** January 2017 to December 2022

• Continuation of *EuroMed RRU Project 2012-2016*
**Project context & Objectives**

- **Creation of integrated transport system based in two pillars:**
  - **(1) Infrastructure:** Mapping & building the Trans-Mediterranean Transport Network (TMN-T)
  - **(2) Regulatory convergence and harmonization**

- This project **assists on regulatory convergence**

- Supporting Southern Mediterranean Partner Countries implement the regulatory aspects of the RTAP 2014-2020

  on Actions:

  - **Action 8:** Efficient land transport systems;
  - **Action 9:** International land transport haulage;
  - **Action 10:** Road safety;
  - **Action 11:** Urban transport
Action 10 RTAP and the EuroMed Task

• Action 10 of the 2014-2020 RTAP for the Mediterranean Region, inter alia, calls upon the EuroMed Partner Countries to:

  ➢ Pursue efforts for setting-up a reliable data collection system on road fatalities and serious road accidents, to facilitate data comparison

  ➢ Share their national data at regional level, similarly to the practice of the European Road Safety Observatory (ERSO) and the Community Road Accident Database (CARE).

• EuroMed TSP Task (Project Activity 1A.2.6. b)

  ➢ TA on setting up road safety reliable, harmonized and comparable data collection system and sharing at regional level
The importance of reliable data

"If you can't measure it, you can't improve it."

Peter Drucker

Austrian-born American Professor of Management
Road Safety Data in the Region

- **Road Safety is a priority** for most EuroMed Partner countries
  - First priority for Tunisia and Morocco
  - Among the country priorities for Jordan, Egypt and Lebanon

- Collection of **accurate data is a major issue for all Partner Countries**

- **Discrepancies between national official data and WHO estimates** were identified requiring full understanding and bridging

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Official Data</th>
<th>WHO Report</th>
<th>Difference in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>6.700</td>
<td>10.466</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>649</td>
<td>1.088</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>1.505</td>
<td>2.679</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>3.832</td>
<td>6.870</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>4.540</td>
<td>9.337</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>768</td>
<td>1.913</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Targeted objectives

• Identify the current situation of data collection and processing in the region (diagnosis)
• Present the best practices and tools at national, European and international level in collecting and processing road safety data
• Understand discrepancies and bridge them
• Strengthen the capacities of stakeholders to improve their performance in collecting and sharing credible, regionally harmonized and comparable data
• Workshops, seminars and meetings for sharing experience and good practice
Review of international experience and good practice

Cooperation and interaction:

- **DG-MOVE**, the European Road Safety Observatory (ERSO)
- the **World Health Organization** (WHO),
- the **IRTAD group** of ITF-OECD,
- the **UNECE and UNESCWA**
- the European Commission **SaferAfrica Project**
- the **SSATP / World Bank**
- the **FIA**
- the **IRF**

✓ Exploitation of **synergies**
✓ **Avoidance** of duplication of efforts
✓ **Benefits for the countries** and the Agencies / Projects
Highlights from cooperation with key players

Improving road crash data collection systems and data sharing in the EuroMed region
ESCWA regional workshop on road safety management in the Arab countries, Beirut, 27-28 November 2018
Brought together the key European and international players with valuable experience on international road safety data quality issues

(EC, WHO, IRTAD, UNECE, SSATP/World Bank, SaferAfrica)

- To exchange experiences on road safety data collection methods and quality issues in the EuroMed partner countries and beyond;
- To enhance common understanding of data quality issues and discrepancies between WHO and national statistics
- To identify common ground for coordinated efforts

Key conclusion:

Readiness to cooperate concrete actions agreed
Identification of the current situation

The questionnaire

- Development of a dedicated questionnaire
- Explicitly designed to analyse both Police and Health Sector data

Diagnostic missions: Cooperation with the national road safety statistical services

Beirut, Sept. 2017
Cairo, Oct. 2017
Marrakech, Oct. 2017
Algiers, Nov. 2017
Tunis, Nov. 2017
Amman, Apr. 2018
First time experts from **Traffic Police, Transport and Health** met at regional level and also with the key international players

- **Best international practices** on road safety data collection and tools presented
- **Reasons of discrepancies** between national statistics and WHO reported, analysed and understood
- Importance for countries to **improve their Health Sector VRD** highlighted
- **Results of the diagnosis work** in the region presented
- **Greek related experiences** presented - **site visits** conducted
- **Successful examples** from the region highlighted
- **Road map** on the way ahead agreed
Diagnostic results

• The need and importance for collection of **road safety reliable, harmonized and comparable data** is fully recognized by all EuroMed Partner countries

• There are significant past and ongoing efforts in all countries and **several good practice elements** for each country to demonstrate

• Considerable **opportunities for transfer of knowledge between countries** in order to share good practice and strengthen cooperation to address the common challenges.

• **Important challenges remaining to be addressed** and elements needing improvement in all countries
## Good practice vs. elements to improve

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Algeria</th>
<th>Egypt</th>
<th>Jordan</th>
<th>Lebanon</th>
<th>Morocco</th>
<th>Tunisia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Definition of fatality at 30-days</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow-up for 30 days</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic means for data collection</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data sharing and publication</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Observatory</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter-sectoral cooperation</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health sector VRD data quality</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Definitions of fatalities

- **Different definitions** of fatalities by the Police and Health Sector
- For the Health Sector the **main source of data is the Vital Registration Data (VRD)**, based on the death certificates (by hospitals and individual practitioners)

Data quality

- Under-reporting of road traffic fatalities is a real challenge in all countries and concerns both, the Police and Health Sectors
- Even for countries with good data systems, difference may occur between reported data and WHO estimates, due to different definitions (Police-Health)

WHO assessment methodology

- **WHO estimated fatalities based on VRD**
- WHO places countries in one of the four Groups
  - **Group 1**: With good VRD statistics (completeness 80% or more)
  - **Group 2**: With other sources of information (including studies) accepted
  - **Group 3**: With population less than 150,000
  - **Group 4**: Without eligible VRD (for which statistical model applies)
Understanding the differences

- The only EuroMed country for which VRD meet the WHO quality criteria is Egypt, while all other EuroMed countries are classified in Group 4, and the WHO statistical model is used to estimate their fatalities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>National reported fatalities</th>
<th>WHO estimated fatalities</th>
<th>Reported VRD</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Completeness</th>
<th>Country classification Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>6700</td>
<td>10466</td>
<td>11000</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>&gt;80%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lebanon</td>
<td>649</td>
<td>1088</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunisia</td>
<td>1505</td>
<td>2679</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>3832</td>
<td>6870</td>
<td>781</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>4540</td>
<td>9337</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>768</td>
<td>1913</td>
<td>669</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- However, there is no single reason for the observed discrepancies.
Intersectoral cooperation is a Must

• **First step:** Identification of the problem and the establishment of cooperation between the Police, Transport Sector and Health/VRD Sector.

• **Mobilization of all relevant authorities,** an important prerequisite in ensuring the engagement to the common objective

• Countries are encouraged to **establish cooperation with WHO** for the identification of country-specific challenges, and request for tailored advice and assistance.

**Intermediate objective:** shift to Group 2

• Cooperation between Police and Health Sector to implement one or more regional studies to estimate under-reporting and project

• **Can be implemented with relatively low resources,** and the cooperation with Universities or Research Institutes may open opportunities

**Eventual objective:** Improve VRD quality to meet WHO criteria and shift to Group 1
Even if the country is shifted to Group 2 or Group 1, *incomplete and inaccurate Police data will result in the persistence of a large discrepancy*

- Adoption and proper implementation of *international definitions and protocols* regarding road crash statistics, indispensable
- Exhaustive *follow-up of fatalities for 30 days* after the crash
- *Cross-checking of Police data with Health Sector data* and other Sectors data
- Strengthening of *cooperation among all agencies* involved in the collection, processing and publication of road crash statistics.
• Aims at assisting EuroMed Partner countries understand the differences between their reported data on road traffic fatalities with the respective WHO estimated included in its Global Status Report of Road Safety.
• Present ways to improve the quality of their statistics and bridge the differences.
• The information in this publication may also assist other countries and regions to address similar challenges.

• Coming soon!...
Ongoing

• Report on road safety data diagnosis and country recommendations
• A joint EuroMed / WHO publication on understanding and bridging the differences between country reported and WHO estimated fatalities
• Publication of EuroMed region road safety data definitions inspired by UNECE Glossary and CADAS
• Implementation of the road map

Following

• National seminars and meetings to present results, share experiences and best practices
• Continue the implementation of the road map
• Assist countries bridge existing data discrepancies and set up reliable, harmonized and comparable RS data collection system
## Road Map

### EuroMed TSP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diagnosis report - country recommendations to improve RS data</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint EuroMed / WHO Leaflet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Good practice report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EuroMed leaflet on harmonized definitions in the region</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA on applying international definitions and standards</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA on bridging the difference with WHO</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitate contact and cooperation with international organizations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Partner countries

- Provide copy of National Data Collection form and definitions
- Establish cooperation amongst Police, Transport and Health/VRD
- Understand VRD quality issues and set objective (Group 2 or Group 1)
- Adopt 30 days definition and improve follow-up procedures
- Implementation of study on under-reporting
- Apply international definitions as per EuroMed recommendations
- Set up of national road safety observatory

- Report

---

Improving road crash data collection systems and data sharing in the EuroMed region
ESCWA regional workshop on road safety management in the Arab countries, Beirut, 27-28 November 2018
Conclusions

- **Road Safety is a priority** for most EuroMed Partner countries
- Collection of accurate data is a **major issue for all Partner Countries**
- **Discrepancies** between official data and WHO estimates **identified/understood**
- **Current situation** of data collection and processing in the region identified
- Challenges include,
  - **Different definitions** of fatalities by the Police and Health Sector
  - **Vital Registration Data (VRD)**, main source for Health sector
  - Data quality due to **under-reporting** in all countries, both in Police & Health
  - WHO assessment methodology, **four Groups** & statistical model for Group 4
- **Intersectoral cooperation** (Police, Transport and Health/VRD Sectors) **is a Must**
- **Continued efforts to improve** all sectors’ data
- **EuroMed/WHO leaflet soon**, followed by
- **Diagnosis and recommendations**
- **EuroMed definitions**
- **Implementation of the Road Map**
The importance of data

In God we trust, all others must bring data

Edwards Deming
Famous American Professor and Statistician
Diagnosis, Identification of gaps and Recommendations, November 2018